

9th International Workshop on Numerical Modelling of High Temperature Superconductors - HTS 2024

# User-defined Superconductivity Formulations in COMSOL -Tipps for Efficient and Reusable Implementations

Sven Friedel

Alexandre Arsenault

# COMSOL Fully Integrated Software Suite

- Multiphysics simulation, from building geometry to results analysis, via a streamlined physics-based modeling workflow
- Application Builder
- Model Manager



# **Typical COMSOL Usage in the HTS Community**

# Select Physics AC/DC AC/DC Agnetic Fields, No Currents Magnetic Fields, No Currents, Boundary Elements (mfnc) Magnetic Fields, No Currents, Boundary Elements (mfncbe) Agnetic Fields (mf) Fields (mf) Fields (mf) Kagnetic Fields (mf)

#### **Built-in Physics Interfaces**

- H-formulation (*mfh*)
- A-formulation (*mf*)
- φ –formulation (*mfnc*)
- Several more...

$$J_{c} = \sigma \mathbf{E}$$
  

$$\mathbf{E} = \rho (\nabla \times \mathbf{H} - \mathbf{J}_{e})$$
  

$$\nabla \times \mathbf{E} = -\frac{\partial \mathbf{B}}{\partial t}$$
  

$$\mathbf{H} = -\nabla V_{m}$$
  

$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} = 0$$

- Use two or more of built-in interfaces and couple in boundaries to obtain H-φ, A-φ, T-A, etc.
- "straightforward"

$$e_{a}\frac{\partial^{2}\mathbf{u}}{\partial t^{2}} + d_{a}\frac{\partial\mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + \nabla\cdot\Gamma = f$$
$$0 = \int_{\Omega} \text{weak } \partial S$$

#### **Equation-based Interfaces**

- Coefficient-form
- General form
- Weak form
- "innovative but nerdy"

# My Topic Today: Further Power Tools Uncovered



#### Select Physics

✓ ▲ AC/DC

#### **Built-in Interfaces**

> 🚴 Electric Fields and Currents

#### 🗸 💁 Magnetic Fields, No Currents

- 🚸 Magnetic Fields, No Currents (mfnc)
- ..... Magnetic Fields, No Currents, Boundary Elements (mfncbe)
- ✓ ₹ Electromagnetic Fields
  - 👧 Magnetic Fields (mf)
  - F Vector Formulations
    - X Magnetic and Electric Fields (mef)
    - .0 Magnetic Field Formulation (mfh)
    - Magnetic Fields, Currents Only (mfco)
- > 🔩 Electromagnetic Heating
- ✓ 4 Electromagnetics and Mechanics
  - Rotating Machinery, Magnetic (rmm)
  - > 🔇 Rotating Machinery, Magnetic–Structure Interaction
  - > 📐 Electromechanics
  - > 놀 Piezoelectricity
  - ≚ Electrostriction
  - ≚ Ferroelectroelasticity
  - > 🔒 Magnetostriction
  - > 🖺 Magnetomechanics
  - > 🐙 Piezoresistivity
- > 🖺 Electromagnetics and Fluids

#### **Advantages**

- Well-established and maintained technology
- Constantly extended by new features
- Easy coupling with any other existing technology

#### **Recent News**

- (mfco) Biot-Savart formulation
- (mfncbe) Boundary Elements formulation
- Time-periodic FEM solver
- Etc...

# Manual Coupling

- Activate 2 or more physics
- Define domains of validity
- Couple at interfaces
- Enjoy many built-in features, e.g. discontinuities, constitutive relations, solver defaults



# Manual Coupling Results

- Proven success in many publications
- Research topics are:
  - Order of shape function
  - Accuracy vs. speed
  - Domain- or boundary coupling



# Why would one use anything else? 🎱

#### Select Physics



# **Equation-Based Interfaces**

#### Pros

- Full control for testing
- Textbook notation

#### Cons

- No default units
- Simple solver defaults
- No constitutive relations
- Basic boundary conditions
- Reuse is "nerdy"

# Equation-Based Modeling

- Used in many publications
- Access to weak form
- 3D, 2D, 1D entities

#### Settings - ₽ Settings - 1 General Form PDE Weak Form PDE E E Label: General Form PDE 1 Label: Weak Form PDE 1 Domain Selection Domain Selection Override and Contribution All domains Selection: Equation Show equation assuming: ĥ Study 1, Time Dependent ÷ • $e_{a}\frac{\partial^{2}\mathbf{u}}{\partial t^{2}} + d_{a}\frac{\partial\mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + \nabla\cdot\Gamma = f$ $\mathbf{u} = [u1, u2]^T$ Override and Contribution $\nabla = \left[\frac{\partial}{\partial x}, \frac{\partial}{\partial y}\right]$ Equation Conservative Flux Show equation assuming: • -u1x х 1/m у $0 = \int_{\Omega} \text{weak } \partial S$ -u1y Г х -u2x 1/m Weak Expressions у -u2y weak -test(ux)\*ux-test(uy)\*uy+1[m^-2]\*test(u) Source Term 1/m<sup>2</sup> 1 1/m<sup>2</sup> Damping or Mass Coefficient • s/m<sup>2</sup> 0 s/m² da s/m<sup>2</sup> 1 s/m² n Mass Coefficient s²/m² 0 s²/m² 0 ea s²/m² 0 s²/m² 0

#### **Example: Magnetodynamic H-** $\phi$ **Formulation [1]**

Second, we implemented the H– $\phi$  formulation with Faraday's law in nonconducting domains, such that the equations are given by [5]

In 
$$\Omega_c^C$$
:  $\frac{\partial\mu\nabla\phi}{\partial t} = 0$   
In  $\Omega_c$ :  $\nabla \times (\rho\nabla \times \mathbf{H}) = -\frac{\partial\mu\mathbf{H}}{\partial t}$ . (5)

We refer to this case as the magnetodynamic H– $\phi$  formulation (H– $\phi$ /D).

The weak equations for this formulation are given by

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\mu \int_{\Omega_c^C} \nabla \phi \cdot \nabla \tilde{\phi} \, \mathrm{d}\Omega - \int_{\Gamma} \hat{\mathbf{n}} \times \mathbf{E} \cdot \nabla \tilde{\phi} \, \mathrm{d}\Gamma = 0 \qquad (6)$$
$$\int_{\Omega_c} \rho \nabla \times \mathbf{H} \cdot \nabla \times \tilde{\mathbf{H}} \, \mathrm{d}\Omega + \frac{\partial}{\partial t}\mu \int_{\Omega_c} \mathbf{H} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{H}} \, \mathrm{d}\Omega$$
$$- \int_{\Gamma} \underbrace{\hat{\mathbf{n}} \times \mathbf{E}}_{\mathbf{E}_{\mathbf{t}}} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{H}} \, \mathrm{d}\Gamma = 0. \qquad (7)$$



[1] A. Arsenault, B. de Sousa Alves, G. Giard, and F. Sirois, «Magnetodynamic H- $\varphi$  Formulation for Improving the Convergence and Speed of Numerical Simulations of Superconducting Materials", IEEE Trans. Appl. Supercond., Vol. 33, No. 7, 2023. <u>https://doi.org/10.1109/TASC.2023.3293449</u>



# Modify Built-in Equations

- Use φ –formulation (*mfnc*) instead of weak form
- Change weak term only
- Enjoy all the goodies of built-in formulation



# Modify Built-in Equations

- Compare compute time
  - PDE Version: 36 s
  - Modified mfnc: 56 s (+55%)
- The PDE version uses less robust solver defaults; need to change those, too.

Solver Level	Setting	PDE	mfnc	runtime [s]
Direct solver	Check error estimate	No	Auto	56
Advanced	Reuse sparsity pattern	off	on	61
Fully Coupled	Jacobian Update	minimal	once per time-step	53
Fully Coupled	Max. No of iterations	4	15	38
Fully Coupled	Tolerance factor	1	0.2	38
Time stepping	Steps taken by solver	free	strict	36
Time stepping	Error estimation	Include algebraic	Exclude algebraic	36
Direct solver	Change from MUMPS to	PARDISO	PARDISO	20

# Do I really need to change 10 settings manually, again? <sup>(2)</sup>



Method Call

**I**COMSOL

- Embed method calls into the Model Builder tree.
- Methods can be refined to detect existing feature nodes.

	$\leftarrow \rightarrow \uparrow \downarrow \ \  \  \  \  \  \  \  \  \  \  \  \ $	₹ -					
	Type filter text						
	<ul> <li>mfh_mfnc_method.mph (root)</li> <li>Global Definitions</li> <li>Pi Parameters 1</li> <li>Pi Parameters 2</li> <li>Pi Parameters 2</li> </ul>						
	Pi Parameters 4	Confirm					
	Pi Parameters 5     Oefault Model Inputs     Materials     Set Magnetostatic Phi     Set Magnetodynamic Phi	?	Modify (mfnc) to Magnetodynam low-level solver defaults?	ic Phi Formulation a	ind activate		
to	<ul> <li>Component 1 (comp1)</li> <li>Definitions</li> <li>M Geometry 1</li> </ul>			Yes	No		
d to	<ul> <li>Haterials</li> <li>Magnetic Field Formulation</li> <li>It Weak Form PDE (w)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Image: Base of the second secon</li></ul>					
	<ul> <li>Magnetic Fields, No Curren</li> <li>Multiphysics</li> <li>Mesh 1</li> </ul>	ts (mfnc)					
	<ul> <li>Study 1 mfh + weak</li> <li>Study 2 mfh + mfnc</li> <li>Results</li> </ul>						

Model Builder



# Can I reuse methods in other files? 🧐



# Add Ins

- Make methods and forms reusable in other models.
- Load Add-in from library.
- Make sure that the Add-in is robust!



# But what if I want to do a 3D model? Rewrite the Add-In? <sup>(2)</sup>



# **Physics Builder**

 Build your own physics interfaces, and use them just like standard COMSOL physics.

#### 🏴 | 🗅 📂 🔙 😣 ト ち・さ・ 咱 伯 田 🗴 🔣 風・| Home Definitions Geometry Materials Physics Mesh Study Results Developer New Model $\otimes$ I have never seen Model Wizard that button! 🧐 $\Leftrightarrow$ Preferences Blank Model 101 III. **Physics Builder** > Application Builder Physics Enable Physics Builder Client-Server > Computing Enable it! 😎 \$2 Email > Files Physics Builder > Geometry > Graphics > Help > Libraries > LiveLink Connections Mesh > Model Builder Model Manager Physics Builder Editor Comments and Documentation Physics Builder Manager

# **Physics Builder**

Physics appear in the regular Select Physics dialog

#### ✓ ↓ Recently Used Jdv Weak Form PDE (w) △u General Form PDE (g) ✓ 🔰 AC/DC > 🚴 Electric Fields and Currents HTS Workgroup Formulations Magnetodynamic Phi Formulation (mfnct) > 垫 Magnetic Fields, No Currents > 🕺 Electromagnetic Fields > 🔩 Electromagnetic Heating > 4 Electromagnetics and Mechanics > 🖺 Electromagnetics and Fluids > 🕺 Particle Tracing Electrical Circuit (cir) > )))) Acoustics > 👯 Chemical Species Transport > 🔰 Electrochemistry > N Fluid Flow > ((( Heat Transfer > III Optics > 🙆 Plasma > 📇 Radio Frequency

Home Physics Interface

Select Physics

> 🚔 Semiconductor

- Definition of weak form in textbook notation.
- Works in all permitted space dimensions, including extra dimensions.
- Default domain and boundary conditions.
- Default solver settings.
- Default Plot groups.
- Version history.
- Compilation.



ru Hans Dhusias Istanface Magnetic Flux Concentrice Duran	i.			
Physics Builder         ← → ↑ ↓ ▼ ↓ ▼ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓ ↓	Settings Weak Form Integrand Expression:	► Equation d timeDerivative(-mur·mu0_const·⊽phi)·test(-⊽phi)	<ul> <li>Physics Builder Manager</li> <li>Physics Builder Manager</li> <li>Version Control</li> <li>Archive Browser</li> <li>Filter:</li> <li>Filter:</li> <li>MagnetoDynamicPhi.r</li> <li>Archives</li> </ul>	
<ul> <li>Developer Comments</li> <li>Dependent Variable Declaration 1 (magneticscalarpotentia</li> <li>Magnetic Flux Conservation, Dynamic (MagneticFluxConse</li> <li>Developer Comments</li> <li>User Input 1 (par.mur)</li> <li>Weak Form Equation 1 (weak1)</li> <li>I Variable Declaration 1 (H)</li> <li>I Variable Declaration 2 (B)</li> <li>Lugation Display 1 (eqd1)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Selection</li> <li>Selection:</li> <li>Output entities</li> <li>Preference</li> <li>Use volume</li> <li>Assume control</li> </ul>	From parent		
<ul> <li>Magnetic Scalar Potential (MagneticScalarPotential)</li> <li>Magnetic Insulation (MagneticInsulation)</li> <li>Result Defaults 1 (pdef1)</li> <li>MSP (pg2)</li> <li>Equation Display 1 (eqd1)</li> <li>Study/Solver Defaults 1 (ssug1)</li> <li>Comments 2</li> <li>Merrison Migration</li> </ul>	Advanced		Version History	
			Þ	Compilation

#### **Take Home Messages**

#### **Modify Built-in Eqns**

Less need to reinvent the wheel, concentrate on your innovation.

#### **Record Methods**

Design reusable model methods to avoid repetitive settings work in one model.

#### Add-ins

Publish methods and user interfaces to be reused in *several models*.

3



#### **Physics Builder**

Design your own tailormade physics interfaces that everybody can use and plug them into COMSOL.

Enjoy the next level of Multiphysics Modeling using *user-defined* formulations.

#### Resources

- <u>11 h course: Modeling with Partial Differential Equations in COMSOL Multiphysics</u>®
- Model Methods
- Add Ins
- Physics Builder

# Who has the first question or comment?

